Learning Transfer & Training Effectiveness

Key Components for Creating Comprehensive Systems of Care: Prevention to Recovery.
Center for Applied Behavioral Health Policy
11th Annual Summer Institute

Thomas H. Coyne, Ed.D., LCSW
TCoyne@ASITraining.com
www.ThomasCoyne.com

Critical Thinking Practitioners Are:

Practitioners who are willing to call into question the assumptions underlying their customary, habitual ways of thinking and acting, and are ready to think and act differently on the basis of critical questioning and new information.

(Stephen D. Brookfield, 1987)

Learning Transfer

The degree of knowledge, skills, and attitudes (KSAs) learned from a training context that is successfully transferred and maintained in a workplace context.

(Baldwin & Ford, 1998; Broad & Newstrom 1992; Burke & Hutchins, 2007; Cheng & Ho, 2001; Rouffer & Goldstein 1995; Xiao 1996)

Training Effectiveness

How effective training is in achieving its intended outcomes.

Training Outcomes:
- Learning Gains
- Learning Transfer
- Organizational Performance Improvement
- Return On Investment (ROI)
Training Evaluation

Training evaluation is used to measure training effectiveness.

Four Levels of Training Evaluation

- Level 1: Reactions
- Level 2: Learning
- Level 3: Transfer
- Level 4: Results

Training Effectiveness Research

The examination of the systemic factors e.g., learner, training, and work environment characteristics that influence training effectiveness.

Training Effectiveness and Learning Transfer:
Why are they important?

The treatment and prevention fields continue to be under increasing pressure to adopt evidence based practices (EBP’s) and interventions to improve performance and achieve successful outcomes.

Millions of dollars have been, and continue to be spent on technology transfer initiatives designed to increase the effective implementation of evidence based practices.

Technology Transfer Initiatives

- 1980’s - Dissemination & Diffusion
  - NIDA Monographs
  - NIAAA Alcohol Alerts
- 1990’s - Research and practitioner collaborations
  - SAMHSA TIPS and TAPS
  - NIDA Technology Transfer Packages & Videos
  - NIAAA Researcher in Residence (RIR)
  - SAMHSA Addiction Technology Transfer Centers (ATTC’s)
  - NIDA Clinical Trial Networks (CTN’s)
- 2000 + - Funding for Technology Transfer Effectiveness Research
  - Blending Products
Training Effectiveness and Learning Transfer: Why are they important?

Workshop trainings are often the method used by themselves, or as a component of a larger technology transfer strategy e.g., dissemination, diffusion, and research and practitioner collaborations designed to speed the implementation of EBP's and interventions into practice.

(Sloboda & Schildhaus, 2002; Walters, Matson, Baer, and Ziedonis, 2005).

Training Effectiveness & Learning Transfer: Why are they important?

Despite these investments EBP's and interventions are not being effectively transferred from research settings to practice settings in a timely fashion.

(Dougherty & Conway 2008, Tai et al., 2010).

WHY?

Haven't You Heard?

Training workshops by themselves are INEFFECTIVE and DO NOT lead to long term changes in clinical skill.

(Fixsen et. al. 2005; Walters et al., 2005).
Why doesn’t training lead to changes in long term skills?

The knowledge, skills, and attitudes (KSAs) learned are **NOT** successfully transferred and maintained in a workplace context.

**QUESTION?**

What percentage of KSA’s learned in a training context are transferred back to the workplace?

- A. 15 – 20%
- B. 25 – 30%
- C. 35 – 40%
- D. 45 – 50%
- E. 55 – 60%
- F. 65 – 70%

Conservative estimates put the rate of transfer of KSA’s learned in training and transferred to the workplace at around 15% – 20%.

U.S. organizations spent $129.60 billion on employee learning and development in 2006.

WHY?

Why aren’t KSA’s successfully transferred and maintained in the workplace?

A. Participants did not actually learn KSA’s in the first place.
B. Training curriculums developed to transfer EBP’s may be ineffective, and or not evaluated for their effectiveness.
C. Evidence based adult learning (training) practices are not used to teach and implement evidence based treatment practices.
D. Organization sent the wrong people to the workshop.
E. None of the above.

证据基于成人学习的学习转移实践是 不用来教授和转移证据基于治疗实践。

The Double Standard or Disconnect

- If a training curriculum is the primary intervention used to transfer proven and effective strategies and interventions into practice, then why isn’t the effectiveness of the curriculum evaluated?
- Shouldn’t the curriculum be proven and effective?
Evidence of a Double Standard or Disconnect?

Federally funded technology transfer initiatives develop and promote training curriculums and trainings that have not been evaluated for effectiveness.

NIDA & SAMHSA Blending Initiative Products

- Treatment planning M.A.T.R.S.: utilizing the ASI to make required data collection useful.
- Motivational interviewing assessment: supervisory tools for enhancing proficiency (MIA - STEP).
- Promoting Awareness of Motivational Incentives (PAMI).
- Short-term opioid withdrawal using buprenorphine.
- Buprenorphine treatment: training for multidisciplinary addiction professionals.

Addiction Technology Transfer Centers

- Promote / list training curriculums that have not been evaluated.
- Primarily utilize training reaction evaluations.
- Continue to use stand alone 1, 2, & 3 day training formats, despite their known ineffectiveness.
- Do not require training workshops to include EBP’s to increase learning & transfer.

Why Isn’t Training Effective?

What does research say?

- Despite the significant role workshop trainings have played regarding the transfer and implementation of EBP’s, training effectiveness research studies or training outcome studies are rare (Baer et al., 2007).
- HOWEVER, there has been substantially more training effectiveness research conducted in the Organizational Performance Improvement (OPI) and Human Resource Development (HRD) fields.
Baldwin & Ford’s Learning Transfer Model

Learner Characteristics
- Ability
- Personality
- Motivation

Training Design Characteristics
- Principles of Adult Learning - Andragogy
- General Principles Theory
- Identical Elements Theory
- Content Relevance
- Sequencing
- Sequential vs. Distributive Days of Training
- Designing for Transfer

Work Environment Characteristics
- Learning / Training Transfer Climate
- Supervisor / Manager Support
- Peer Support
- Opportunity to Use / Practice
- Performance Feedback & Coaching
- Intrinsic & Extrinsic Rewards for Using New Learning
- Learning Organization / Learning Culture

©TCoyne2010
Learning Organizations / Culture

A learning organization / culture demonstrates and values the importance of the acquisition and application of new knowledge and skills gained by many means, including but not limited to formal training.

(Marsick & Watkins, 2003; Tracy et al., 1995)


- Create continuous learning opportunities
- Promote inquiry and dialogue
- Encourage collaboration and team learning
- Create systems to capture and share learning
- Empower people toward a collective vision
- Connect the organization to its environment
- Provide strategic leadership for learning

Kontoghiorghes's Learning Transfer Model

How Can We Improve Training Effectiveness?

Include evidence based adult learning practices and interventions in the training design to increase learning, and learning transfer.

Interventions can be implemented Pre, During and Post Training / Learning Event.

(Broad and Newstrom 2002)
Transfer Intervention Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pre-Training</th>
<th>During Training</th>
<th>Post Training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trainers</td>
<td>• Communicate training goals and expectations to trainees and supervisors.</td>
<td>• Utilize Evidence Based Learning Principles and Identical Elements &amp; Collaborative Experiential Learning</td>
<td>• Follow Up Evaluation Performance Feedback and Coaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Conduct a needs assessment.</td>
<td>• Goal Setting</td>
<td>• Ensure CEUs and Certificates are delivered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Communicate realistic training goals, objectives, and individual and organizational benefits.</td>
<td>• Identify Barriers to Transfer</td>
<td>• Relapse Prevention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learners</td>
<td>• Discuss with supervisors why the training is important to individual and organizational performance.</td>
<td>• Participate Review Goals Develop Action Plan Review Learning Contract</td>
<td>• Meet w/ Supervisor and or peers Review Learning Contract Review Goals Review Action Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Complete assigned readings before training.</td>
<td>• Avoid contacting learner while at training. Make sure learner's work is covered while out of office.</td>
<td>• Monitor Performance Review Learning Contract Meet Training Event Support, Give Feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisors</td>
<td>• Discuss why the training is important to individual and organizational performance.</td>
<td>• Complete Learning Contracts.</td>
<td>• 30 Day Follow Up Learning Measure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managers</td>
<td>• Ask to bring back materials.</td>
<td>• Cover Work Load Support Support in practice etc.</td>
<td>• Be Supportive Enquire about learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peers</td>
<td>• Discuss why the training is important to individual and organizational performance.</td>
<td>• Support the training context. Ask to bring back materials. Support Attendance</td>
<td>• Provide reading materials and handouts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pre-Training

- Get stakeholder support, and include them in the design phase.
- Engage learners directly prior to the workshop.
- Provide description of workshop, abstract, goals, objectives, organizational and career benefits.
- Administer Pre-Training needs assessment / learning measure & provide feedback.
- Have participants complete a knowledge and skill self assessment.
- Have participants complete a learning contract.
- Provide reading materials and handouts.

During Training

- Provide realistic expectations.
- Goal Setting.
- Emphasize collaborative and experiential exercises.
- Provide performance feedback.
- Using a cognitive task analysis sequence learning accordingly.
- Identical elements.
- Evaluate training delivery during training.
- Review learning.

Post Training Interventions Designed to Increase Learning, and Transfer

- Follow UP Needs Assessment / Learning Measure
- Follow Up Knowledge and Skill Self Assessment
- Review Learning Contract / Agreement
- Post Training Goal Setting
- Relapse Prevention
- Performance Feedback and Coaching
- 30 Day Follow UP Learning Measure.
- Performance feedback and coaching.
- Learning Transfer Portals
Pre – Conference Preparation

I met with my supervisor/administrator to discuss which workshops would be best to attend for my continued professional development.

- Yes, we would do that!
- Yes, but it’s a good discussion.
- No

I met with one or more of my co-workers to discuss which workshops would be best to attend for my continued professional development.

- Yes, we would do that!
- Yes, but it’s a good discussion.
- No

©TCoyne2010
RECOMMENDATIONS.

- Become an informed consumer of training and education services and hold yourself, your organization, provider, and funder of training, technical assistance & education services accountable.
  - Are they using an evidence based curriculum?
  - What evidence based adult learning practices are incorporated into the design and delivery of the workshop?
  - How is the training designed for transfer?
  - How will they measure effectiveness?
  - How do they define effectiveness?
  - Evidence of past effectiveness?

RECOMMENDATIONS.

- Implement policies and / or practices supporting learning.
  - Use learning contracts / agreements.
  - Identify individual employee performance strengths and needs and match to workshop goals & objectives.
  - Identify the organizations performance strengths and needs and match to workshop goals & objectives.
  - Develop and implement a mechanism where new learning formal and informal is captured, stored and shared.

RECOMMENDATIONS.

- Award CEU’s based on performance vs. attendance, or a combination of both.
  - Provide CEU’s for any pre, and post training exercises.
  - Utilize a blended learning approach incorporating the internet and onsite training.
Final Thoughts

- The people we serve have a right to receive evidence based treatment and prevention services.

- The behavioral health care workforce has a right to receive evidence based training when learning about evidence based practices and interventions.

Resources

- American Society of Trainers and Developers
  - http://www.astd.org/
- Chief Learning Officer Magazine (FREE)
  - http://www.clomedia.com/
- International Society for Performance Improvement
  - http://www.ispi.org/
- National Addiction Technology Transfer Center
  - http://www.nattc.org/explore/priorityareas/techtrans/training/trainingpoint.asp
- National Institute on Corrections
  - http://nicic.gov/Trainers
References


LEARNING CONTRACT

Learners Name: (Last) ________________________ First: ____________________________
Employer: ___________________________________________________________________
Job Title: ____________________________________________________________________
Learning Contract With: ☐ Supervisor: ☐ Manager: ☐ Peer: ☐ Other: ___________
Name of person contracted with: __________________________________________________

Name of workshop(s) to be attended:

a.) __________________________________________________________________________
b.) __________________________________________________________________________
c.) __________________________________________________________________________
d.) __________________________________________________________________________
e.) __________________________________________________________________________
f.) __________________________________________________________________________

Goals & Objectives:

1.) I met with my supervisor and / or peer and discussed the goals and objectives of the
workshop(s) listed above on: (DATE) __ __ / __ __ / __ __ .

2.) How are the goals and objectives of the workshops listed above related to the
performance of the tasks associated with your current job title and functions?
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________

©TCoyne2009 www.ThomasCoyne.com
3.) How will achieving the goals and objectives of the workshop(s) listed above improve your individual performance in your current job title?
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________

4.) How will achieving the goals and objectives of the workshop(s) listed above improve the organization’s performance?
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________

5.) How will achieving the goals and objectives of this workshop impact / influence / benefit your personal and / or professional development?
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
6.) Regarding the goals & objectives of the workshop(s) list above, I most need to focus on:
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________

7.) Regarding the goals & objectives of the workshop(s) list above, my supervisor / administrator / manager / peer suggested I should focus on:
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________

8.) Following the conclusion of the workshop we have agreed to meet on:

DATE __ __ / __ __ / __ __ __ __ , at TIME: __ __ / __ __ am / pm, to discuss my learning regarding the above, and develop a learning plan in order to successfully transfer and maintain the knowledge and skills acquired during the workshop back into the workplace.

PART II: AGREEMENT
This learning agreement may be terminated or amended by either of the two parties at any time upon written notice, which is received and agreed to by the two parties.

Learner Signature: Date:

Supervisor / Manager / Peer Signature: Date:

Supervisor / Manager / Peer Signature: Date:
(Copies of this agreement should be distributed to all parties)
Learning Event & Technical Assistance Proposal Requirements and Format

The primary Outcome Measures of successful learning events (i.e., workshops, trainings, and conferences) should be; learning, improved individual and organizational performance. A review of the literature indicates that there are multiple systemic factors (i.e., Participant Characteristics, Event Design Characteristics, and Organizational Characteristics) that influence these primary outcomes.

The interaction of these characteristics during any of the three stages of a learning event (i.e., pre-event, during the event, and post event), can inhibit or enhance learning, retention, and transfer, ultimately influencing the primary outcomes of improved individual and organizational performance.

Therefore, we require all contractors submitting proposals for the delivery of all “Learning Events” (workshops, trainings, meetings, and conferences) to include in their proposal, a description of the specific design characteristics and evidence based adult learning practices that will be utilized Pre, During, and Post Learning Event to enhance learning, retention, and transfer from the “Learning Event”, back to the workplace resulting in improved individual, and organizational performance.
In addition to the inclusion of the above, all contractors must include the following in their proposal, and in the following format:

- Speakers Name and Credentials
- Speakers Biography:
- Title of Presentation:
- Target Audience / Pre-requisites
- Description / Abstract:
- Workshop Goals:
- Individual Objectives / Outcomes:
- Organizational Objectives / Outcomes:
- Career / Job Relevancy:
- Pre event requirements (Readings, Surveys, Exercises):
- Post event requirements: (Surveys, Follow UP Learning Measures):
- Plan to evaluate the workshop experience (Include Copy of Evaluation:
- Plan to evaluate the effectiveness of the workshop (Plan to measure learning / performance, Pre, and Post Learning Event, and Follow UP - 30 Days Post Event (Include copy of any Pre, Post, and Follow UP Measures):
- Workshop Format and Detailed Workshop / Training Agenda (Including Methods Used in Each Module):
- Maximum number of participants:
- Description / Copy of the evidenced based training curriculum being used:
- Copy of all handouts, exercises, and support materials:
- Names and contact information for at least two recent clients, (organizations) who received the same, or similar workshop / training.
Proposed Cost / Estimate:

Please include a breakdown of your cost estimate to include the following:

Daily On Site Rate:
Hourly Off Site Rate (if necessary):
Travel Time Rate (if necessary):
Hours / Days Preparation:
Number of days of delivery:
Hours / Days Post Delivery:
Air Fare:
Meals: (State Rate)
Hotel: (State Rate)
Mileage (State Rate)
Taxi:
Rental Car:
Training Materials:
Copying:
Other:

Please note, NO contracts and/or agreements are final until approved by the Chief Learning Officer (CLO). We look forward to working with you, and thank you for your time, expertise and dedication in designing, delivering, and evaluating a very successful learning event for our practitioners.

Thank You!